

## “Animal Behaviour” review form example

### Assignment:

Students are assigned the task of producing a succinct account of a recent publication in the style of a ‘News & Views’ piece for the journal *Nature*. Each student then reviews three student assignments. Each student also has the opportunity to give feedback on the quality of the review through a “feedback form”

### Review form:

#### *Overall:*

1. What do you think are the main strengths of this News and Views article?
2. What are your main suggestions for improvement to this article?
3. Did you feel that the article had good flow and structure? Was it easy to follow the author's train of thought from one paragraph to the next?
4. Has the article been carefully proofread - is it free of grammatical and typographical errors?
5. Is the balance between the different sections about right? Or has too much space perhaps been allocated to one section (e.g. background) at the expense of another (e.g. results)?

#### *Structure:*

1. Was the title short, informative and catchy?

Yes/No

Comments/justification

2. Does the 3-line summary adequately relay the essentials of the study (problem - solution - wider implications)?

Yes/No

Comments/justification

3. Is the problem clearly stated? Does it agree with your own understanding, from reading the paper?

Yes/No

Comments/justification

For more information about student peer review, visit: <http://peerreview.cis.unimelb.edu.au>

Support for this project has been provided by the Australian Government Office for Learning and Teaching. The views in this project do not necessarily reflect the views of the Australian Government Office for Learning and Teaching.

4. As a reader, did you feel that enough background information was provided to allow you to understand the study's key outcomes?

Yes/No  
Comments/justification

5. Have the key results of the study been outlined? Is all the information necessary?

Yes/No  
Comments/justification

6. Has the author made an attempt to critically appraise an aspect of the study?

Yes/No  
Comments/justification

7. Is the importance of the study placed into perspective?

Yes/No  
Comments/justification

Feedback form:

1. This review helped me improve my News and Views article

- Strongly agree
- Agree
- Undecided
- Disagree
- Strongly disagree

2. This review was:

a) **Balanced:** it highlighted both strengths, and areas for improvement

- Strongly agree
- Agree
- Undecided
- Disagree
- Strongly disagree

b) **Insightful:** the review pointed out things I hadn't thought of myself

- Strongly agree
- Agree
- Undecided
- Disagree
- Strongly disagree

c) **Helpful:** it contain specific suggestions that I will be able to implement

- Strongly agree
- Agree
- Undecided
- Disagree
- Strongly disagree

d) **Authoritative:** the review had read the literature and knew their stuff

- Strongly agree
- Agree
- Undecided
- Disagree
- Strongly disagree

e) **Clear:** the review was well-written and easy to understand

- Strongly agree
- Agree
- Undecided
- Disagree
- Strongly disagree

3. I would take the opportunity to participate in peer review again

- Yes/No
- Comments/Justification