

“Experimental Animal Behaviour” review form example

Assignment type:

In Experimental Animal Behaviour, students work in groups of four to carry out a research project and write a report. Although the research is carried out in groups, students prepare and submit individual reports. Each student then reviews two reports, and receives three reviews (two from peers and one from tutor).

Review form:

Review summary: Briefly summarise the study, and the main strengths and weaknesses of the report (about 100 words):

1. Style: Has the report been adequately proof-read?

Yes/No

2. Title and abstract

a. Is the title appropriate for the study?

Yes/No

b. Is the abstract a good summary of the essentials of the report?

Yes/No

3. Introduction

a. Does the introduction identify the problem and explain why it is important?

Yes/No

b. Is the relevance of the study to the problem explained?

Yes/No

c. Are the aims of the study clear and specific?

Yes/No

Elaborate on your reasons for the answers to sections 2 and 3 above (up to 100 words)

4. Methods

- a. Are the methods described in sufficient detail for the study to be repeated?

Yes/No

- b. Is the experimental design sound (e.g. have the authors considered issues such as observer bias, randomisation, independence of data)?

Yes/No

Elaborate on your reasons for the answers above (up to 100 words)

5. Results

- a. Are the data clearly presented and easy to interpret?

Yes/No

- b. Are the data in the most appropriate format (e.g. would any information be better placed in the text, rather than as a figure or table, or vice-versa)?

Yes/No

- c. Is it clear what statistical tests were used, and are the statistics reported appropriately?

Yes/No

Elaborate on your reasons for the answers above (up to 200 words)

6. Discussion

- a. Are the most important findings summarised at the beginning?

Yes/No

- b. Are all of the important findings discussed?

Yes/No

- c. Is the author's interpretation convincing (i.e. there are no alternative explanations for the patterns discussed)?

Yes/No

- d. Are the findings placed in a broader biological context by relating them to other studies?

For more information about student peer review, visit: <http://peerreview.cis.unimelb.edu.au>

Support for this project has been provided by the Australian Government Office for Learning and Teaching. The views in this project do not necessarily reflect the views of the Australian Government Office for Learning and Teaching.

Yes/No

- e. Does the author touch on potential problems with the experimental design, and suggest improvements?

Yes/No

Elaborate on your reasons for the answers above (up to 300 words):

Feedback form:

1. **Value of the review:** this review helped me improve my Experimental Animal Behaviour report:

Strongly agree
Agree
Undecided
Disagree
Strongly disagree

Comments/Justification

2. **Reviewer's comments:** What did you find helpful/unhelpful about the comments from your reviewer?

3. **Participation:** I would take the opportunity to participate in peer review again

Yes/No
Comments/Justification